United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization  
National Roundtable on Technical and Vocational Education and Training

Introduction:
A roundtable of relevant stakeholders to discuss the problems and issues that pose a challenge to the efficient and effective implementation of Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) in Pakistan has been proposed. Since the birth of the Nation in 1947, various models and curricula have been developed to deliver TVET at the general school and post school levels with outcomes that have been unsuccessful or at best partial success. In Pakistan, as in many countries, the implementation of TVET has often been under different government departments with some times overlapping mandates. Efforts to streamline the organization and coordination of TVET at the national and provincial levels have seen the formation of institutions that have brought most of the relevant activities under a single unit.

With the current population estimated at 180 million and with a growth rate of 2.2%, by 2050 the population is projected to have 236 million people in the working age group. Unfortunately, “Hardly 16.3 percent of the youth cohort completes secondary education, with the result that more than three-quarters exit the educational system without any foundational or life skills. Moreover, less than 6 percent of the youth population has been reported to have acquired any technical skills through Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) while only 2.5 percent have reported On-Job-Trainings. Hence, the majority of Pakistan’s emerging labour force is either without education and skills or has very little of both.” (57) Thus the sustainable delivery of quality TVET is critical to the attainment of Pakistan’s economic development goals. A brief background is here given regarding the development of TVET in the general school curriculum and at the tertiary level.

Background:
The concept of integrating vocational education with general education has been advocated for a long time in Pakistan. In his message to the first “All Pakistan Education Conference” held in October 1947, the Founder of the Nation, Quaid-e-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah, stressed the need for scientific and technical education in order to build the economic future of Pakistan. In the light of the recommendations of the Council of Technical Education established in 1948, Technical High Schools were established with the objective of exposing students to the world of work along with general education. Another effort in this respect was made by the Commission on National Education (1959) that made the following specific recommendations on this issue:

i. Making handwork and practical activities compulsory in the school course at the primary and secondary levels.

ii. Diversifying the school curriculum by enriching it with a series of optional practical courses in technical, agriculture and home economics subjects. The first stage of diversification was proposed after class VIII. A second major diversification was suggested after class X to train technicians.

In pursuance of the recommendations of the Commission on National Education, pilot secondary schools were established with provisions for teaching of Industrial Arts, (Woodwork, Metalwork, and Applied Electricity), Home Economics, and Agriculture. The subject of Commerce was introduced at secondary level by launching the Practical Arts Scheme. However access to the ‘practical’ subjects was limited as such schools were located in cities and big towns, thus providing access to a very small percentage of the relevant student population. A number of other in-school and out-of-school factors also contributed toward non-realization of the objectives of the scheme.

Later, two further attempts in this direction were made, firstly in the early seventies with the launching of the Agro-Technical Scheme and secondly in 2002 introducing a technical stream. Currently technical/vocational subjects (other than home economics) are being offered at secondary level in around 1000 schools (about 10 % of total). The two initiatives for the introduction of technical and vocational education (TVE) at secondary level have not proved successful. Studies sponsored by UNESCO and JICA during 2003 and 2006 respectively revealed the poor state of TVE in schools. In 2008, UNESCO assisted the Government of Pakistan Administered state of Azad Jammu and Kashmir to conduct a diagnostic study of the technical stream in secondary schools within that province. The study reported serious problems associated with the design and delivery of technical subjects, including lack of adequately trained teachers, poorly equipped workshops, lack of funding for procurement of training materials and maintenance and replacement of worn out equipment and tools. Besides, attitude and lack of understanding on part of the Head Teachers and senior administrators was also at least partially responsible for poor state of affairs. A number of recommendations were proposed to address these problems. It is important to note that the National Skills Strategy has spoken on the need to develop a sustainable model of TVE in the school system.

The focus of TVET in Pakistan might have been more on tertiary programmes; however, there is need to create clear and strong linkages with the general education system. In this regard, the Pakistan Education Policy calls for debate on the profiles and numbers of skilled manpower that Pakistan needs for its development that should be trained in the formal system of education at vocational schools and technical institutes or polytechnics.

The delivery of TVET in specialized institutions has generally been better than that in general schools. Various programmes of varying duration that currently exist intend to serve different market needs. Vocational courses with more practical content (80%) are offered at the

---

Vocational Training Institutes with the purpose of producing skilled tradesmen. Entrants into the labour market who are expected to work to fill the technician positions are trained in Polytechnics and Colleges of Technology. Courses at this level have more theoretical (40%) content than vocational courses (20%). Administratively, vocational courses have historically been placed under the supervision of Ministries of Labour and Manpower while technical courses have been under the Ministries of Education. Besides, other departments/organizations such as Social Welfare Department, Small Industries Corporation, Agriculture department etc., were also involved in TVET.

In order to bring all TVET activities under a single body, Punjab Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority (Punjab TEVTA) was established in 1999. At the national level the National Vocational and Technical Education Commission (NAVTEC) was formed in 2006, with the specific objective of streamlining TVET in the country by bringing all the players under a single coordination body. NAVTEC facilitated the development of the National Skills Strategy 2009-2013, to guide the national vision of making Pakistan a developed, industrialized, just and prosperous country by 2030 and of meeting the Millennium Development Goals by 2015. While some Provinces already had institutions that managed TVET, those which did not, have since put in place or are in the process of putting in place a Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority (TEVTA) to complement the NAVTEC in delivering TVET at that regional level. Now in its fifth year of operations, the effectiveness of NAVTEC in coordinating the delivery of TVET in the country has been questioned. The Pakistan Planning Commission seems to have surmised the opinion of many when it stated in its Growth Strategy report, “As the National Vocational and Technical Education Commission did not fulfill its mandate of providing leadership to provincial TEVTAs by establishing a scientific mechanism of providing demand driven curriculum the TVET seen in Pakistan remains largely fragmented.”

Recently the Government of Pakistan made an amendment to devolve more authority to the Provinces. The 18th Constitutional amendment is expected to have far reaching effect on the role of Provinces in the delivery of services to the people. To this extent the Provinces have moved quickly in the TVET sector to map out areas of cooperation needed between them to maintain high standards and how this could be achieved. A meeting for this purpose was held in Sindh Province on December 20, 2010 where an inter-provincial committee was mooted. Meanwhile, an amendment has been enacted replacing the current NAVTEC by NAVTTC (National Vocational and Technical Training Commission) as a federal body overseeing the TVET sub-sector.

Funding of TVET has been problematic even for some of the richer nations of the world. It is expensive to start a TVET institution due to the specialized equipment and buildings needed. And once in place the running costs tend to be higher than other forms of education or training due to consumable materials needed. Some countries have therefore tended to explore ways of raising funding for TVET outside of the regular budgetary allocations. Some of these include initiating some type of training levy (tax) payable by potential employers or by buyers of their

---

products. In other innovative approaches institutions are encouraged to explore their own ways of fund raising through production units, marketing their courses to a higher paying clientele during down times, renting out their facilities, etc. At the present time Pakistan relies largely on government grants which more often than not are inadequate. There are well equipped institutions that lie dormant or underutilized if donor funding is not available to pay for the cost of training.

**Intervention**

A three-day National Roundtable involving all key TVET stakeholders with the participation of selected national and international experts will be organized to arrive at a consensus on national vision and strategies related to TVET, and the roles it can play to meet the developmental needs of Pakistan. The event will be organized in collaboration with NAVTTC, Provincial TEVTAs and Education Departments. Departments of Labour and Manpower, Departments of Industries and Commerce, and Chambers of Commerce and Industries will be other key stakeholders in planning and implementing the event. Private sector and key NGOs in TVET will also participate in the Roundtable.

**Themes of the Roundtable**

The roundtable will have three themes, namely:

1. The role of TVE within the general education system
2. Coordination of TVET as a consequence of the 18$^{th}$ amendment
3. Sustainable funding of TVET

**Organization and Funding of the Roundtable**

The Roundtable will be organized by UNESCO in partnership with ILO under One UN Education Programme Component 4 in conjunction with the Government of Pakistan as represented by the relevant departments. UNESCO and ILO shall jointly provide technical support and funding for the Roundtable with other interested bilateral and multi-lateral development partners.

**Expected Results:**

Theme 1: TVE in General Education: Relating education to the world of work has been a long cherished goal of educational planners and policy makers. Based on recent studies sponsored by UNESCO and JICA and feedback from various stakeholder groups, there is strong support for TVE in the general education system in Pakistan. Proponents of TVE have often cited the large
number of youth who do not complete secondary education for one reason or another as well as those who do not proceed with school beyond this level. To this group TVE would give the youth some employable skills. However, there is no consensus as to the type of TVE that should feature in those early stages. Recommendations have varied from very specialized competency based to general exploratory type of TVE. However, an important consideration in this debate is the question of the sustainable cost of offering TVE in the school system and the necessary political will to support its inclusion in the general education curriculum. TVE is clearly more expensive than other subjects in the school curriculum and the more specialized the higher the cost. The participants at the roundtable would have an opportunity to review the past experiences within Pakistan, issues and challenges (including those related to gender) and lessons learnt, experiences of other countries in the region and/or those with similar socio-economic conditions and determine what would be most appropriate for Pakistan. Important points of discussion should include sustainability of the programme, ways to address the issues of girls’ participation in TVE, teacher training, and quality assurance.

Outcome: A sustainable model of TVE in general school curriculum best suited to the needs of Pakistan.

Theme 2: Coordination of TVET: Pakistan has recently made a constitutional amendment No. 18. The main outcome of this amendment is to increase devolution and powers to the Provinces to determine their development. After the enactment for establishment of NAVTTC in place of NAVTEC as a federal body to deal with vocational and technical training there is need to discuss the mechanism for decision making, policy and planning of TVET at the national and provincial levels for smooth functioning of and better coordination between national and provincial bodies.

Outcome: Mechanism for coordination of TVET in post 18th amendment and establishment of NAVTTC scenario

Theme 3: Funding of TVET: Sustainable funding of TVET has often been a major challenge to most countries and especially developing countries. Without adequate and sustainable source of funding it is difficult to envisage a TVET system that produces quality graduates that meet market demands. Donor funding can be very useful in developing the infrastructure and procurement and installation of relevant equipment. However, governments and communities must find adequate funds to pay for the running (recurrent) costs of the facilities. Participants should review alternative sources of funding TVET that could be tapped to complement government subventions.

Outcome: Identification of sustainable funding sources for supporting TVET

Roundtable Participants:
- Federal and Provincial education and human resource development policy makers, planners and administrators.
- National and Provincial TVET policy makers, planners and administrators.
- National Planning Commission members/representatives.
- Private sector (Chambers of commerce, Industry association)
- Non-profit Non-governmental Organizations in TVET Sector
- Selected international experts on thematic issues - to bring in expertise from countries with similar social, political and economic background.
- Representatives of various UN Agencies and other international agencies working in TVET sector.

### ROUNDTABLE RESULTS MATRIX

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Performance indicator(s) (a maximum of three)</th>
<th>Means of verification (data source) (Optional)</th>
<th>Programmed benchmark (on basis of baseline data if available (1))</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>National Roundtable organized by the end of 2011</td>
<td>3 Roundtable background papers (1 for each theme)</td>
<td>A background paper on TVE in general schools in Pakistan, past strategies, experiences and lessons learnt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A background paper on Skills Strategy 2009-2013 and coordination of TVET;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A background paper on financing of TVET in Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>6 Round table discussion papers (Focusing the three themes and gender issues in TVET)</td>
<td>-International and regional models of TVE;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-Inputs onto a successful TVE, teachers, infrastructure, materials, funding;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- making the NSS work for Pakistan;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Coordination of TVET in Pakistan;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>- Reviewing TVET funding options;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>-introducing sustainable funding of TVET in Pakistan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Resolutions Passed | 6 (or less) key resolutions with political and programmatic commitments from federal and provincial governments
1 final report of the Roundtable
Publication and dissemination of report. |