PAKISTAN ADMINISTERED STATE OF AZAD JAMMU & KASHMIR

SKILLS DEVELOPMENT POLICY, STRATEGY AND ACTION PLAN

Ahmed Ferej, PhD
UNESCO TVET Consultant

August 09, 2009
PAKISTAN ADMINISTERED STATE OF AZAD JAMMU & KASHMIR

SKILLS DEVELOPMENT POLICY, STRATEGY
AND
ACTION PLAN

Ahmed Ferej, PhD
UNESCO TVET Consultant

August 09, 2009
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Acronyms</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive summary</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.0 Background</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Methodology</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.0 General Education System in Pakistan and AJK</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Technical and Vocational Education and Training Context in Pakistan</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 The National Vocational and Technical Education Commission</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Technical and Vocational Education Authority</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 TVET in the Context of AJK</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.0 Issues facing TVET in AJK</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 TVET policies at the national level</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Market Driven Training System – relevance</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Inadequate or inappropriate training equipment</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4 Skills Standards</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5 Quality assurance</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6 Outdated Curriculum</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7 Poor Perception of the skilled worker</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.8 The Apprenticeship System</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.9 Integration of the Informal Training into the Formal Sector</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.10 Research and Development</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.11 Accreditation System for TVET Institutions/Programmes</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.12 Training for TVET Teachers</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.13 TVET in the Secondary Level Curriculum</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.14 Funding of TVET for Development and Recurrent Expenditure</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.15 Equity and Access</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.16 Strengthening of Management and Coordination of TVET</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.0 Stakeholders’ Meeting – August 4, 2009</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Consolidated Logframe</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.0 Efficacy of Implementation of the Action Plan</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Factors that would successful implementation</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 Constraints to Implementation of the Action Plan</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 Role of Development Partners</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4 Way Forward</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## APPENDICES

1. Summary of Strategy and Action Plan
2. References
3. List of stakeholders consulted
4. Sample Interview Questions
5. List of participants at experts meeting for presentation of draft report
ACRONYMS

AKSIC  Azad Kashmir Small Industries Corporation
AJK   Pakistan Administered State of Azad Jammu and Kashmir
ASDES  AJK Skills Development and Employment System
ATTTC  Agro-Technical Teacher Training College
CBT   Competency-Based Training
EC    European Commission
EIC   Employment Information Center
EWDC  Employment and Women Development Center
FBS   Federal Bureau of Statistics
HRD   Human Resource Development
ILO   International Labor Organization
IT    Information Technology
ITC   Industrial Training Center
LMIA  Labor Market Information Analysis
MIS   Management Information System
MTC   Multi Trade Center
NAS   Needs Assessment Survey
NAVTEC National Vocational and Technical Education Commission
NGO   Non-Government Organization
NRSP  National Rural Support Program
NSC   National Skills Certificate
NWFP  Northwest Frontier Province
PTI   Polytechnic Institute
RC    Rural Center
RHEC  Rural Household and Education Center
RTP   Registered Training Provider
SDC   Skills Development Center
SDEC  Skills Development and Employment Committee
SWWDD Social Welfare and Women’s Development Department
TEVTA Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority
TF    Task Force
TQIF  Training Quality Improvement Facility
TQIP  Training Quality Improvement Program
TVET  Technical and Vocational Education and Training
UC    Union Council
UNESCO United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNDP  United Nations Development Program
VTI   Vocational Training Institute
VYC   Vocational Youth Center
WDC   Women Development Center
WITS  Women Industrial Training School
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Pakistan Administered State of Azad Jammu and Kashmir (AJK) Skills Development Policy, Strategy and Action Plan has been prepared upon the request of the AJK Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority (TEVTA) to UNESCO. In spite of the title of the report the focus was on developing Strategy and Action Plans as Policy is the domain of the National Vocational and Technical Education Commission (NAVTEC).

A participatory methodology was adopted that involved among others the study of relevant reports of the government of Pakistan such as the NAVTEC Strategy paper, the Ministry of Education Draft Education Policy, the Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper, AJK at Glance from the Department of Planning and the AJK Skills Development and Employment System prepared with the help of the ILO. Direct consultation with key stakeholders at their location was carried out in Islamabad, Lahore, Muzaffarabad and Mirpur. Other useful documents were reports of UNESCO consultants. After these two phases, 15 priority issues were identified from which strategies and action plans were developed and presented to stakeholders on August 4, 2009 in Muzaffarabad. Their feedback has been included in the final document.

The issues identified covered a wide spectrum of Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET). These were: lack of clear articulation of national policy, poor perception of TVET, lack of skills standards, lack of quality assurance, lack of training or inadequately trained TVET teachers, inappropriate or inadequately training equipment, lack of clear accreditation system, inadequate funding, outdated curriculum and lack of relevance to the world of work, lack of credible information (R&D), lack of equity and access in all regions and for all, inefficient apprenticeship systems, the need to integrate and improve informal apprenticeship training, inclusion of technical and vocational education into the secondary curriculum and strengthening management and coordination at the local and national levels. For each of these issues a strategy was presented in the context of AJK and action plans to address them were presented.

It is clear from reviewing the list of action plans that some would take a lot longer than others and would need heavy investment of human and material resources. Others would require fairly obvious routine administration decision or action by AJKTEVTA. For example, setting dates for regular consultation with key public and private implementers of TVET should be easy to move forward. Such consultations however, would have valuable benefit as implementers outside of TEVTA would have an opportunity to be informed of the organization’s plans and duplications could be avoided and wider coverage of courses achieved. In other instances TEVTA has already appointed officers and placed them in the field as in the case of Monitoring and Evaluation experts stationed in the three divisional headquarters of AJK. The three have been provided with the tools to do the work. What would be needed to improve their effectiveness is training.

Implementation of other action plans such as developing a TVET training programme or center within the AJK would take much more time and resources. In the interim AJK could possibly rely on outside help, such as training in Pakistani institutions. In the longer term two ideas have been presented to TEVTA, either to build a training center from the ground up or to set up teacher education unit within an existing institution in the AJK. The cost is much lower in the second option but the idea would need the buy in of TEVTA.
Improving funding to TVET sector is crucial for development purpose and for meeting recurrent expenditure. TVET is an expensive undertaking and lack of funds has severe impact on the quality of trainees. AJKTEVTA were encouraged to explore alternative funding of TVET even as the government is being asked to increase its allocation towards the production of well trained skilled human resources for its economic development. Alternative potential sources of funding include: production units in the institutions, providing market required courses during idle time or long vacations and through introduction of training levy to end users.

AJKTEVTA should appeal to development partners to support TVET by preparing well conceptualized project proposals of the issues identified in this report. Other partners already have their work plans prepared; AJKTEVTA could request their adaptation where possible, with a view to addressing some of the issues. It is understandable that AJKTEVTA, being a young institution, still lacks competent staff in all areas of its mandate, but with focused leadership they can chip away at the issues while developing their internal capacity.
1. BACKGROUND

Pakistan Administered State of Azad Jammu and Kashmir has its own elected government led by a Prime Minister with a ceremonial President. The state is largely mountainous with three large rivers flowing across it. It has a population estimated at 3.7 million in 2007. The state’s economy is based on subsistence agriculture, livestock keeping, mining, tourism, and sale of electrical power. The state depends on Pakistan for its outlet to the rest of the world as well as technical support in the running of its economic affairs. Each government department in AJK has a corresponding one in Islamabad, the seat of government of Pakistan. The peoples of the two states move across boarders unhindered. Commercial activities between the two are also conducted unhindered. AJK has a literacy rate of 64%.

It is essential therefore, for the purpose of this report, to describe the policies and strategies of Pakistan TVET before that of AJK as often the one has direct implementation impact on the other. Many students from AJK undertake their post secondary education in the larger Pakistan as there are more opportunities there with more institutions available to them. Quotas are provided for students from AJK in Pakistani institutions of higher learning.

1.1 Methodology

The problems faced by AJK TEVTA in its nascent form in coordinating and managing the implementation of TVET in the state are immense. In part because it is a young institution and is still building its internal capacity and in part because there are several issues in TVET that need to be developed, streamlined, clarified, unified etc before effectiveness and efficiency can be attained. The purpose of this work, therefore, was to put forth some guidelines that would contribute towards achieving this goal of effectiveness and efficiency.

The method devised for achieving the objective of this report included: 1. reviewing all relevant reports that exists in Pakistan and AJK on education and TVET, government polices; and review relevant reports from the region on TVET; 2. meet with key stakeholders to seek out their views on the various issues in TVET; 3. present a preliminary draft to key stakeholders to get their feedback; and 4. finalize the draft based on the feedback received from the stakeholders.

2. General Education System in Pakistan and AJK

The general education system is structured into 5 years of primary level after pre-school; 3 years of middle level; 2 years of secondary; and finally 2 years of higher secondary. There are drop outs at each transition points due to various reasons including lack of adequate schools for the next level close enough to those desiring admission; lack of schools with the correct sex orientation (beyond primary level public schools are usually single sex institutions); poverty, even though schooling is free for the first five years there are some costs in the subsequent levels, others particularly those in the rural areas might not wish to continue as extra help is needed to work the land. There are therefore, opportunities at every

---

1 Azad Kashmir at a Glance (2007)
transition point to place an effective skills development programme of varying durations. And there are indeed various programmes from short 3 months courses to 1 and 2 year certificate courses for those who complete their general education at slightly upper levels. The informal sector also attracts a large number of youths for training through the traditional apprenticeship system (Ustaad-Shagird).

2.1 Technical and Vocational Education and Training Context in Pakistan

Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) in Pakistan is currently offered at three levels culminating in a Vocational Certificate, Technical Diploma or a Degree. For each level the programme is usually offered at a different institution and for varying durations.

There have been attempts at various times in the past to introduce a pre-vocational programme at the secondary level. The last effort was the introduction of a parallel technical education stream in 2001. It is key objective was to give the students the opportunity to explore technical and vocational education and increase their career choices upon graduation. A pilot programme was initiated in which 1100 schools in all districts in the country were selected to participate. The project was discontinued in 2006 before the results and impact of the pilot were assessed. A new initiative has been introduced in the on going education policy review in which the subject has once more been included. NAVTEC in its national strategy has also indicated support for the inclusion of the subject at the secondary level grades 9 and 10. When the subject is introduced it will be incumbent for the government to re-establish training of teachers for TVET as all the institutions previously engaging in this area are no longer in operation, barring one in AJK which too needs strengthening.

Vocational certificates are usually of one to two years duration and training taken in vocational institutions. These institutions have varying names such Vocational Training Centers, Vocational Training Institutes, etc. Sometimes shorter programmes running anywhere from three to six months are provided. Entry point for the longer vocational certificate courses is completion of grade 10 education. However, for the shorter courses of 3-6 month duration, entry requirements are more flexible.

Technical Diploma programmes which culminate in the attainment of the Diploma of Associate Engineer (DAE) are provided by Colleges of Technology or Polytechnics and are three years in duration. Entrants would have successfully completed 10 years (Matriculation) of general education before being admitted. Students who have successfully completed the DAE can continue for a further four years pursuing the Bachelor of Technology (B.Tech) degree in a College of Technology. A small number (about 5%) with exceptional pass in the DAE are annually admitted to pursue a Bachelor of Science engineering degree. However, they are not given any credits for work covered in the DAE and have to complete the whole 4 year programme.

Two kinds of degrees are offered in technology and engineering. Students who complete 12 years of general education and with an appropriate qualifying marks are admitted to the Bachelor of Science degree which takes four years (engineering) in universities around the country. Both the B. Technology (Hon) and B Sc Engineering degrees are considered equivalents for purposes of employment but there is a debate raging among the professionals
as the Pakistan Engineering Council has been reluctant to register B. Technology graduates as engineers.

The NAVTEC National Skills Strategy 2009-2013 published in 2009, and citing the Medium Term Development Framework 2005-2010, indicates that the country has an annual training target of 950,000 appropriately skilled workers while enrolment in the same year across 1,647 technical and vocational institutions was only 315,000\(^1\). Clearly there is a big shortfall in the number of required skilled workers. And this data might not have taken into consideration the number of qualified skilled workers who leave the country each year for work abroad. The federal and regional governments through NAVTEC and TEVTAs, therefore, have a huge task to ensure that the training institutions can cope with the demand for skilled workers for the country’s economic development.

### 2.2 The National Vocational and Technical Education Commission (NAVTEC)

NAVTEC was established in 2006 with the mandate to facilitate, regulate and provide policy direction for TVET to meet national and international demand for skilled human resources. NAVTEC has recently developed a framework upon which to deliver its mandate called “Skilling Pakistan: the National Skills Strategy, 2009-2013.” The strategy outlines three objectives against which a total of twenty reforms are proposed as:

1. Providing relevant skills for industrial and economic development
2. Improving access, equity and employability
3. Assuring quality control

While NAVTEC is the apex policy body, at the Provincial level TVET is implemented by the Technical and Vocational Education and Training Authorities (TEVTAs).

### 2.3 Technical and Vocational Education Authority

Each province and the state of AJK have formed a TEVTA to coordinate and implement TVET in their region. The strategy is usually to take over existing public TVET institutions with the mandate to produce skilled workers operating under different departments such as education, agriculture, manpower, and social welfare. While in some provinces TEVTAs have only been recently formed and are struggling to find their place, in the Province of Punjab their TEVTA predates NAVTEC, having been formed in 1999. The other TEVTAs in the country are fortunate to have a system in place in the country from which to learn from.

\(^1\) The National Skills Strategy, 2009-2013
### Table 1. Existing Training Capacity of Public TVET Institutions in AJK

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of Institutions</th>
<th>Total Number Today*</th>
<th>Course Offering</th>
<th>Annual Capacity</th>
<th>Training Output</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Type</td>
<td>Duration</td>
<td>Before EQ</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2006-07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TEVTA</td>
<td>55</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1661</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>traditionally</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3910</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTI</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WITS(M)</td>
<td>35[14]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>784</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VTI(M)</td>
<td>6[3]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITC(M)</td>
<td>2[1]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MTC(F)</td>
<td>3[1]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VYC(M)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VYC(F)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDC(M)</td>
<td>21</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>753</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDC(F)</td>
<td>21</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>827</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AKSIC</td>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>770</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>770</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Handicrafts(F)</td>
<td>15[7]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solar Energy(M)</td>
<td>4[1]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SWWD</td>
<td>26</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>650</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WDC(F)</td>
<td>21</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>525</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RHEC(F)</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grand Total</td>
<td>100 (Plus 42 SDCs)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>8152</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Numbers in bracket under this column represent the number of centers damaged by earthquake (EQ) but obviously excludes those constructed after the EQ

**Abbreviations:**
- M – Male; F – Female; T – Trade; PTI – Polytechnic Institute; WITS – Women Industrial Training School; VTI – Vocational Training Institute; ITC – Industrial Training Center; MTC – Multi Trade Center; VYC – Vocational Youth Center; SDC – Skills Development Center; WDC – Women Development Center; RHEC – Rural Household and Education Center; TEVTA – Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority; AKSIC – Azad Kashmir Small Industries Corporation; SWWD – Social Welfare and Women’s Development Department

**Source of Table:** AJK Skills Development & Employment Skills (ASDES), 2008 and with partial figures added for school 2008-09 added from AJKTEVTA

### 2.4 TVET in the Context of AJK

The programme of general education and TVET in Azad Jammu and Kashmir (AJK) is similar to that in the other provinces of Pakistan. Students are in fact free to move from AJK
to institutions to the rest of Pakistan. And upon graduation from any of the TVET programmes, Kashmiris are free to seek employment in Pakistan or other countries abroad.

With a projected population of 3.7 million (2007), AJK currently has only one Polytechnic and 100 vocational institutions (Table 1). Plans are underway to increase the number of TVET institutions in the state by building two more Polytechnics in Mirpur and Muzaffarabad and constructing or establishing 51 more vocational centres in various locations.

2.4.1 The Earthquake and its Impact on the TVET in AJK

The earthquake that hit the region in 2005 created a massive devastation in all sectors of the economy with a large death and injury toll. Many TVET institutions were seriously damaged and lives of staff members lost. In the wake of the earthquake, there was a big surge of intervention by international community to help AJK recover its institutional capacity. There were many groups that offered short term courses in needed skills areas such as construction. There are no records of the number of persons trained through this system. Other organizations including UNESCO joined in assisting the government in rebuilding some of the damaged institutions. To date not all have fully recovered. Table 1 gives an indication of the institutions that are currently operational as at 2008.

2.4.2 Organizing TVET in AJK

The mandate of NAVTEC is extended to AJK. And like the other provinces, AJK formed its own TEVTA in 2007 with the mandate to coordinate and implement TVET programmes in the state. In AJK some vocational training institutions are under the auspices of the semi-autonomous Azad Kashmir Small Industries Corporation (AKSIC), and the Social Welfare and Women’s Development Department (SWWD). While their operations are essentially independent there is some overlap. For example the Director of AKSIC explained that while his agency implemented skill training of three months or less AJKTEVTA was responsible for those of longer period. Unfortunately, he explained that TEVTA was not in a position at the present time to assume that responsibility. The role of the private sector in the provision of TVET in AJK is considered minimal and confined to courses in commerce. Some training was conducted in the aftermath of the earthquake by various NGOs, and international organizations, but these were transient as most have since exited the scene.
2.4.3 Shortcoming of Skills Development in the AJK

The earthquake disaster of 2005 cannot in itself be considered the major course problems in skills development in AJK. Several efforts have been made to identify the underlying problems of skills development in the state by UNESCO and ILO among others. The government of AJK has only recently (July 2008) compiled a report by a Task force on “Employment & Skills.” This work facilitated and supported by the ILO raised key issues in skilled development and proffered some solutions to address them\(^1\). UNESCO has also completed a diagnostic study (yet to be published) of the Technical Education Stream at the Secondary level which revealed that the option was indeed desired by most stakeholders but there remained many issues related to the effective implementation of such a programme\(^2\). In addition UNESCO has sponsored several other consultant assessment of the TVET sector whose findings closely match the outcomes of the reports by other groups. Furthermore in the preparation of this report extensive bilateral consultation was carried out with key stakeholders (see Appendix III). The issues raised in these consultations are similar to those found by previous efforts.

Issues that have been raised in nearly every forum include lack of adequate national policies, outdated curriculum, lack of skills standards, lack of or inadequate links between institutions and the workplace, underutilization of equipment and facilities, inadequate qualified teachers, weak apprenticeship system among others. In the next section these issues have been discussed and strategies and action plan for addressing them presented.

3. Issues facing TVET in AJK

Several issues were outlined at a stakeholders workshop held in Islamabad on 18/11/2006 supported by UNDP and ILO. In addition the team preparing this initial draft has, after consultation with a wide range of stakeholders in Islamabad, Lahore, Muzaffarabad and Mirpur, raised some more issues not covered at the workshop in November 2006. During consultations with NAVTEC its leadership reiterated its mandate as the apex TVET body nationally and policy formulation was key to that mandate. At visits with TEVTA Punjab and AJKTEVTA the same line was taken, i.e. NAVTEC was responsible for policy formulation while the TEVTAs where responsible for implementation on the ground. To its credit NAVTEC has completed its strategy paper which for all purposes and intent is a policy guideline. However, at the TEVTA level that strategy has not seemingly arrived possibly because the National Skills Strategy has not yet been formally endorsed by government. The areas identified for reform and necessary action in the strategy paper will take time to be achieved. The TEVTAs must therefore essentially work from the NAVTEC strategy to develop their own strategies and activities on the ground that will essentially contribute towards the effectiveness in implementation of TVET without necessarily supplanting the mandate NAVTEC.

All the issues that were identified at the national level where also indicated as affecting AJK to varying degrees. For each issue that has been identified, and for the purpose of moving

\(^1\) AJK Skills Development and Employment System (2008)
\(^2\) Diagnostic Study of the Technical Stream at Secondary Level in the Pakistan Administered State of Azad Jammu & Kashmir
forward AJKTEVTAs own mandate, direction will be sought from the NAVTEC strategy in formulation of local strategies and action plan for the purpose of creating an effective, efficient and coherent institution.

3.1 TVET policies at the national level

NAVTEC which came into existence in 2006 as the apex of TVET in the country has recently completed a strategy document whose mission is “To provide policy direction, support and an enabling environment to the public and private sectors to implement training for skills development to enhance social and economic profile.”¹ In our meeting with the Executive Director of NAVTEC we learned that the document was yet to receive formal approval from the government but was in actual fact being applied to address several TVET issues. NAVTEC has outlined three key objectives with a total of twenty action points it proposes to implement to streamline TVET and make it effective and efficient in producing the skilled human resources the country requires. At the present time some of these are statements of intent and will take time to filter down to TEVTAs. So in fact Provinces are still going about their business as they have always done before the arrival of NAVTEC. However all are in the process of developing TEVTAs to coordinate the activities of TVET in their area. These TEVTAs in turn are still fine tuning a system for coordination of their roles.

The NAVTEC skills strategy is a policy framework that covers most of the areas of concern raised during each of the stakeholder consultations attended. Nearly all the issues generated at the Islamabad stakeholder consultations plus those added after this series of consultations have been addressed in this strategy document.

Implementation Strategy

While recognizing that NAVTEC is responsible for developing national policies for guiding the implementation of TVET in the country, AJKTEVTA should develop its own strategies for addressing its issues in line with the national guidelines.

Action Plan

- AJKTEVTA to hold a workshop on the NAVTEC Strategy for stakeholders in AJK. Awareness of the content of the document will greatly aid in their implementation role.

3.2 Market Driven Training System - relevance.

The relevance of training to the needs of the market has been questioned by several sources. In an interview with the President of the Islamabad Chamber of commerce and Industry, he stated that employment positions were often available but the persons trained in the TVET institutions did not always fit. He complained that institutions have continued to train following outdated curricula without consultation with the employers. NAVTEC accepts this shortcoming and has listed a strategy to address the issue. The Chamber indicated that employers are even willing to cooperate with the institutions by providing needed training equipment to address specific needs. The AJK Chamber of Commerce and Industry Mirpur

¹ The National Skills Strategy (2009)
expressed similar sentiments with the added information that there were no formal contacts of any kind between employers and institutions training skilled workers. While NAVTEC is committed to a curriculum review the process will certainly take an extended period of time. In the interim, however, AJK could institute measures that could ameliorate the situation through introduction of work attachments and developing strong institution management boards that will incorporate the private sector. Internships, industrial or workplace attachments are very important phases of skills training. Well organized work attachments would have two important outcomes. Firstly, the learners would have the opportunity to work in real work environments and perhaps be exposed to equipment and tools that are not available at their institutions. Secondly, the instructors while visiting their learners will get an opportunity to interact with the employers or their representatives and build a relationship, observe the workplace and possibly some of the operations being carried out and compare with the skills being imparted at the institutions. The instructors might be able to make adjustments in their training. As part of the training process, trainees should be required to write down their experiences in approved format which should be regularly checked by their work supervisors and finally by the college staff assigned oversight role of the trainee.

The time honoured tradition of market survey is crucial in designing the type of training that meets the needs of the market. In the case of Pakistan and AJK that aspect is lacking to a very large extent. In discussion with the AJK Chamber of Commerce and Industry, they did not even know what the VTI closest to them was offering! While the needs of the local market should be considered, the case of AJK is unique in the sense that many of its citizens seek employment in Pakistan and abroad, principally in the Emirates and United Kingdom. The planners should take this aspect into consideration when planning course content.

Having strong institution management boards is a good governance mechanism that promotes transparency. The membership of the boards should be broad based and must include employers through Chamber of Commerce or Federation of Employers. Such representation gives both sides opportunities to appreciate their roles and mutually beneficial intervention could be developed.

**Implementation Strategy**

AJK should implement a monitored work attachment for all trainees taking certificate vocational courses of a year or longer and diploma courses for a period of not less than two months. The attachment shall be assigned a grade.

Regular market survey and training needs assessment should be conducted to make sure the courses offered remain relevant.

To increase transparency, relevance and involvement in the welfare of the TVET institutions by stakeholders, AJK should mandate the establishment of management boards in every institution. As key stakeholders, employers must be represented in these management boards.

**Action Plan**

- TEVTA should hold workshops for capacity building of Managers and instructors for the effective implementation of a work attachment programme.
- Within the TEVTA secretariat identify a focal point for work attachment and make appropriate budget provision for its implementation.
3.3 Inadequate or inappropriate training equipment

TVET training equipment is often relatively expensive to procure. Due to funding situation, institutions are often faced with either outdated machinery or broken equipment due to lack of funds. This affects the quality of the trained graduates because there may not be enough equipment for each learner to have necessary time for practical or to produce the quality of experience necessary. This issue is closely related to the quality of skilled workers produced and the poor perception of vocational training by the trainees, employers and the community. There have also been observations that training facilities are underutilized by being put to use only when students are in the institutions. Government must be lobbied to provide more funding for TVET institutions for updating and maintenance of equipment and teaching materials. At the same time TVET institutions must be encouraged to take advantage of their location and available equipment to generate income to supplement government subventions. There have been several different approaches towards meeting this objective such as establishing production units; running additional courses during institution idle time to cater to the needs of fee paying students; renting out facilities for public functions such as meetings, workshops, etc. Institutions managers will need training to ensure transparency (ability to manage the funds generated), ability to market their facilities effectively and the efficient utilization of the funds generated. Instructors will also need to be given incentives if they are to teach beyond prescribed time. Furthermore, the institution should be allowed to keep the generated funds while government grants previously allocated to the institution is maintained.

Implementation Strategy

*Appeal for more funding from budgetary sources (Govt) while exploring alternative funding sources to supplement that of the government.*

Action Plan

- **Hold workshop for institution managers for capacity building for preparation of budget proposals and developing a case for increased funding,**
- **Conduct workshop for institution managers on developing alternative income generation and its efficient utilization for the betterment of their institutions.**

3.4 Skills Standards

At the present time there are few practical courses that have skills standards developed. Skills standards are necessary where high standards are demanded as they specify the knowledge and skills levels that must be exhibited by the trainee at the end of a specified period of training. Skills standards go hand in hand with the evaluation process as it provides the criteria for testing. Some work has been done already and UNESCO is, for example in the process of facilitating the development of skills standards in Carpentry and supplied to
TEVTA samples of trade skills standards from Sri Lanka. While curriculum is likely to be reviewed in the future, training is nevertheless progressing and developing skills standards for the various vocational courses is necessary. TEVTA should take advantage of the upcoming intervention by UNESCO to field a consultant to write skills standards for some trades areas for capacity building of its staff. Once the staff go through the process a couple of times then it would be easier for them to guide the other trade specialists in developing standards for their own courses. Should the curriculum be reviewed or new courses developed then there would be capacity already built at TEVTA to undertake the task.

Proposed strategy

*TEVTA shall develop internal capacity to develop skills standards for all its courses.*

**Action Plan**

- *Train senior instructors in the development of skills standards for their trade areas*
- *Develop skills standards for courses currently being offered by TEVTA*

3.5 Quality assurance

To ensure quality graduates are produced by the training institutions it is necessary that the process is monitored through out. First, there needs to be a curriculum that meets the needs of the workplace, second the delivery of the material must be effective, third the testing system should be to high standards and designed to test that which is in the curriculum. In its strategy document NAVTEC has stated the need for reform of the curriculum, introduction of the modularization and Competency Based Training (CBT) system and an evaluation mechanism such as the NQF. In addition there should be adequate monitoring system to ensure that the training process is efficiently implemented. NAVTEC is leading the process of developing the appropriate mechanisms that will be applied throughout the county and AJK to ensure mobility of workers internally and externally. In the interim AJK could improve its system without prejudice to the national systems being developed. It should introduce a system that will have a strong credibility. According to a TEVTA official evaluation for the DAE is through examination accessed from Punjab. This will certainly increase credibility as its graduates would easily be accepted for employment and further education and training in that Province and others. For vocational courses, AJK has its own internal system. In itself a good one as the official explained that examination papers are developed from question items obtained from across the board. For vocational training, due to the weight of the practical component over the theory, practical testing is more crucial. To create that stronger acceptability it would help to have testing by an external source. AJK could benefit from exploring the NTB testing system and strengthening its system so that a third party evaluation is conducted.

**Implementation Strategy**

*AJK should strengthen its quality assurance through an effective monitoring and evaluation system.*

**Action PLAN**
• TEVTA should develop a strong monitoring system through use of qualified instructional supervisors (Monitoring and evaluation experts).
• Introduce skill testing system similar to that of the NTB. The Unit created at TEVTA will take over the activities under the NQF when the programme is ready.

3.6 Outdated Curriculum

At the present time a national curriculum does not exist for all courses. For example in AJK, the short three months skills programme is administered using a curriculum developed by the ILO, the one-year vocational programme using a curriculum developed by the National Training Board (NTB) and the Diploma for Associate Engineer (DAE) using a curriculum from Punjab. Curriculum by its very nature must undergo periodic review to bring it in line with national objectives and aspirations. TVET curriculum is more vulnerable as rapid technological changes have made it imperative that a curriculum is designed that is flexible enough to accommodate changes in between major reviews. In a rapidly changing technological era the workplace is evolving quickly as competition forces employers to change to keep pace or outdo rivals. Workers therefore need to be educated and trained in ways that make them open to adaptation through self learning, workshops, and links with institutions that are endeavouring to stay on the cutting edge. NAVTEC is well aware of the problem as stated in its strategy document and in due course will coordinate the development of national curriculum for the various programmes.

In the interim a curriculum innovation that AJK could adopt is the introduction of entrepreneurship education for all its trainees enrolled in institutions under its mandate. Knowledge of entrepreneurship gives trainees who eventually enter self employment a better chance of survival in the business. Information Technology (IT) is also essential for every worker or citizen. In AJK the IT Board is in the process of trying to implement the programme in all secondary schools.

Implementation Strategy

AJK should continue using current curricula until the review process is initiated by NAVTEC. Longer term AJK needs to strengthen its secretariat by recruiting and training curriculum experts. In the meantime AJK should strengthen its courses by introducing entrepreneurship education and IT into its programmes for all trainees.

Action Plan

• No immediate action is called for with regard to the technical curriculum currently in use until NAVTEC initiates a national review process,
• Review available entrepreneurship and IT curricula available for TVET students (ILO has one already developed for entrepreneurship),
• Identify teachers who are interested in the teaching of the new subject (entrepreneurship) within institutions and organize appropriate training during the long summer breaks. The IT Board should support the IT component.
3.7 Poor Perception of the skilled worker

Lack of adequate recognition by the labour market and the community has been a long-term problem for TVET graduates. The problem is made worse when the sector does not seem to have implemented strong systems for ensuring credible qualifications. NAVTEC plans to institute a NQF to address the matter of skills credibility and to ensure recognition of certificate holders across the nation. Salaries also need to be competitive with those of graduates of other programmes. A TVET graduate will have little professional respect if his or her earnings are half of those of others who might have completed the same number of years of education and training. During stakeholder consultations it was observed that certain parts of the AJK did not have much faith in the graduates of vocational institutes. The reasons were poor training facilities, poorly trained teachers, and lack of interest by their youth. It is necessary for AJK to institute a vigorous campaign to revamp the quality of its vocational institutions if they are to remain competitive in training skilled workers for local and international markets. Quality issues such as market relevant programmes, curriculum, skill standards and supervision have been discussed elsewhere. In addition, articulations in programmes will encourage students to feel attracted to the vocational programmes as they are able to see advancement ahead without losing all the time spent on an earlier course. Provision should be made for recognizing work covered in the vocational programmes by those wishing to join DAE programmes to pursue courses that are similar.

Implementation Strategy

Provision should be made in TVET programmes to ensure that candidates who successfully complete approved courses are allowed to proceed to the next one in a similar field with appropriate credits granted. This will encourage students to see upward mobility should they wish to pursue further training and education.

Action Plan

- TEVTA to set up a committee to review its courses and to determine amount of credit to be offered to those wishing to pursue higher level courses

3.8 The Apprenticeship system

NAVTEC in our meeting indicated that one of its proposed actions was to reform the apprenticeship system by updating the 1962 Apprenticeship Ordinance, in order to modernize it and bring it into line with current international and regional practices and to domesticate it for Pakistan. They conceded that the apprenticeship system as it is has proven unpopular and ineffective in producing well trained skilled human resources and that the employers have tended to take advantage of the trainees.

TEVTA reported that it does not have an effective formal apprenticeship system in place in AJK. In its present design the apprenticeship system envisaged larger industrial set up which had vested interest in training workers to meet it own needs. Internationally, apprenticeships are closely guided by government statutes which indicate remuneration, duration of training, in-school components, and types of testing and certification of the apprentices upon successful completion of their programmes. In our visit to Mirpur, which is the largest
industrial base of the state of AJK, we were informed that the industries, most of which were Pakistani in origin hired nearly all their skilled workers from Pakistan and Kashmiri workers formed the large pool of unskilled labour. Both the Department of Industry and Chamber of Commerce found it difficult to explain why the Kashmiri workers did not seek training in the TVET institutions in its locality or even within other parts of the state. It seems evident, therefore, that the large pool of unskilled local workers might have otherwise benefited from an organized apprenticeship system.

**Implementation Strategy**

*Explore the viability of introducing formal apprenticeship system in locations where there is strong presence of industries such as industrial zones in Mirpur.*

**Action Plan**
- *Initiate a study into the implementation of the apprenticeship system in areas where many industries are located,*
- *Develop a curriculum suitable for supporting the apprenticeship training that will be taken by trainees to supplement their practical training within their workplaces.*

### 3.9 Integration of the Informal Training into the Formal Sector

In many developing countries the informal sector has provided a large sink for absorbing persons who cannot find work in the formal sector or do not have appropriate formal qualifications. These individuals join artisans in the informal sector to secure training under some agreed arrangement. In Pakistan the Ustaad-shagird (Master-Apprentice) is one such method. The training system has some distinct advantages when compared to the formal training programmes as they do not require academic entry criteria except interest to learn by the trainee; fees are non existent or minimal; learning is unstructured and unscripted – the trainee is exposed to whatever happens to be the project being undertaken by the Master; there is no fixed duration as trainee is free to exit whenever they feel they have acquired sufficient skills; each individual is allowed to progress at their own pace; and there are no formal certification required. The informal on-the-job training sometimes within very narrow occupational contexts has some draw backs. The learners do not have systems for acknowledging their competencies; the knowledge and skills acquired are limited to what the master and others within the work unit posses; and trainees can be exploited by the master during training.

A system needs to be developed that will encourage this type of training, take advantage of its positives and provide a system for validating what has been learned to give the trainee flexibility in the workplace and reduce undue exploitation by the trainers. Recognition will aid the trainee should they wish to join the formal sector as an employee or trainee. Those choosing to immigrate abroad for jobs are under more pressure to seek this formal recognition. It is indicated within the NAVTEC proposed NQF that some accommodation will be made for recognition of the training acquired in the informal sector through Recognition of Prior Learning (RPL).

AJK has plans to strengthen training in this sector. According to an official, it is being considered to register all trainers (Ustaads) and trainees with the TEVTA and with the nearest vocational institution to the training site. Periodically the trainees would be brought to the
institution for supplementary training. The trainer could also be paid a small fee for his services and the learners a stipend. This approach would provide recognition to the system of training and the intervention could raise quality of training. A provision for recognizing training obtained from this sector by validation through the trade testing system would also contribute to the improved perception of the informal sector training.

**Implementation strategy**

*Within the trade testing system proposed elsewhere provision should be made for testing of informal sector skills. Such testing could even take place at the same time as that of candidates of vocational institutions when testing is being conducted for the same level.*

**Action Plan**

- Introduce skills testing similar to those for the formal sector (i.e. grades 1, 2 and 3).
- Devise a system of allowing informal sector trainees to attend VTIs for some theory input where possible.

### 3.10 Research and Development

In addition to the supervisory mechanism proposed herein, an effective Research and Development unit in the TEVTA is important. Such a unit would be responsible for the effective monitoring and evaluation of the programmes and their impact after training has ended. Not to be confused with the role of supervision this unit should be responsible for carrying out feasibility studies on what programmes are needed in a specific area and feed that information to programme planners. They should also conduct tracer studies of those who have completed their training to understand how their graduates are performing in the world of work to determine if the knowledge and skills acquired was being used for the intended purpose. The feedback is important in determining the viability of courses while providing rich information for improving course offerings, teaching techniques and for curriculum review. A management information system (MIS) should be developed that will collect and store all necessary data related to the role of TEVTA. At the same the R&D unit should be responsible for collecting relevant information being assembled by other organizations such as the Labour Market Information System (LMIS). According to AJK some staff members have been assigned R&D responsibilities but work under the Director of Planning. The same source indicates that thorough training for the staff member and senior management on the role of R&D is necessary before its true value can be appreciated.

**Implementation Strategy**

*Establish within TEVTA an R&D unit whose key functions would be to conduct feasibility and post training studies to determine needed courses and effectiveness of the programme in meeting intended objectives. In addition this Unit would be responsible for collecting and analysing all enrolment data from the institutions as well as from other relevant sources.*

**Action Plan**

- Recruit qualified individuals for the position(s) of R&D within TEVTA
• Organize the training of the selected individuals. Assistance could be requested from say, the Punjab TEVTA which has had such a unit for extended period of time for advice and possibly attachment for the selected individuals.
• Provide the necessary technical equipment for the storage and analysis of data.

3.11 Accreditation System for TVET Institutions/Programmes

Currently all the institutions that were government owned were transferred directly to the TEVTAs. Those privately owned have had to undergo some type of inspection before accreditation or affiliation with TEVTA is approved. TEVTA should have a manual clearly indicating the standards expected for the public and private training facilities, qualification of teachers and quality of courses offered to be met before institutions or programmes should be accredited. Subsequently periodic inspection should be conducted to ensure quality education and training is provided. Elsewhere in this report it has been proposed that instructional supervisors (monitors) be recruited and trained. In practice it is these same supervisors who would be responsible for ensuring that new institutions meet the stated criteria for their operation. According to its strategy document, NAVTEC will at some point enunciate accreditation criteria to be adopted nationally. This is necessary to ensure cross transfers of students between institutions and regions and quality assurance of training offered at the institutions. In the interim AJK should promulgate its own criteria and bring them in line with those of the NAVTEC when those are prepared.

Implementation Strategy

Minimum acceptable standards for public and private TVET institutions shall be developed and implemented.

Action Plan

• Develop a manual of standards for TVET institutions,
• Train staff as part of wider dissemination of the manual

3.12 Training for TVET Teachers

Information from different sources suggested that training of TVET teachers has often been conducted in a haphazard manner when compared to training of teachers for other subjects. Instructors are recruited based on their technical qualifications and immediately posted to teach in various institutions. Training where provided might come later for short periods often in the form of in-service training. It is now a well established fact that it is desirable for teachers at all levels to have professional training. At the present time there are no clear incentives for an instructor recruited purely on his or her technical qualifications to seek professional teacher training. To encourage untrained TVET teachers to seek training there needs to be differentiated salary structures for trained and untrained instructors at the same technical level.

In its skills strategy document NAVTEC has clearly pronounced on the desirability of training for TVET teachers and set in motion activities for developing minimum level to be
attained before one is allowed to be considered a fully fledged instructor. Government should be encouraged to set up and equip teacher training institutions that would produce quality instructors.

In AJK teachers who teach introduction TVE in middle school are trained for one year after grade 12 at the Agro-Technical Teacher Training Center (ATTTC) in Muzaffarabad but those who teach at the secondary school level (grades 9 and 10) are not trained after DAE. It is important that AJK promotes a tradition of respecting professionalism through appropriate training and salary incentives. The state should mandate that all teachers at whatever level should have professional teacher training. The ATTTC in AJK should be revamped to offer the needed services for teachers of general school and other TVET institutions. This facility was seriously damaged during the earthquake and to date has not been reconstructed.

**Implementation Strategy**

*AJK shall require all TVET teachers to attain approved teacher qualification and introduce a career path.*

**Action Plan**

- *Establish a TVET teacher training center or use exiting facilities.*
- *An alternative is to establish a teacher education department in a Polytechnic/VTI in AJK,*
- *Develop a career path for TVET teachers to attract good quality candidates to join the profession.*
- *Provide incentives for teachers to acquire teacher qualification.*

3.13 TVET in the Secondary Level Curriculum

The Ministry of Education of Pakistan is currently in the process of reviewing the education sector policy. Technical Vocational Education (TVE) has been proposed for inclusion into the curriculum. TVE has had a chequered history in the national curriculum and an initiative to introduce a new TVE curriculum beginning in 2003 and piloted in 1100 schools in Pakistan and AJK was discontinued in 2006. Before that there had been experimentation with various formats including the industrial arts model where students were exposed to a general introduction course in woodwork, electricity and metalwork and the agro-technical model. In the new initiative the model of TVET to be implemented has not been decided. NAVTEC supports this position and explains that an appropriate model will be adopted from countries that have included TVE in their curriculum and be domesticated to fit the needs of Pakistan. In Pakistan TVE has often been introduced in the middle school (years 6, 7 and 8) and secondary level (years 9 and 10).

Internationally the issue of vocational education in the general school curriculum has been a subject of intense debate. In the 80s for example, there was a debate raging in the US Canada on what type of TVE if any should be included in the curriculum. There is a school of thought that argues that introducing this type of education at the general education level is pre-mature, counterproductive and expensive. Exposing everyone who might in the end not select TVET, it is argued, is a waste of resources. The other side of the debate argue that not providing a choice in technical and vocational education to students is denying them an
opportunity to find out if they have the interest and aptitude to pursue it after school. Some have argued that in a country like Pakistan and AJK, where most students do not go on to any other form of further education or training post school, vocational education would provide them with the only opportunity to have some basic skills to take to the world of work. Several countries in the West seem to have selected a middle ground with most providing a general orientation (technology education) course in grades 7, 8 and 9 and some kind of specialization in grades 10, 11 and 12. The UK seems to have introduced what is referred to as Design and Technology which is essentially a general programme in the last three years of secondary education.

In the interviews we conducted in Pakistan and AJK most respondents supported the introduction of technical education at the secondary level, a finding which supports a recent survey by UNESCO (2008) on the subject. There is already some limited implementation of technical and vocational education in some AJK middle and secondary schools. In middle school, grades 6, 7, and 8, some schools are offering an introductory subject which is composed of metalwork, woodwork, and electricity. Girls’ schools offer home science option. The teachers of the subject have been hereto trained in AJK’s only TVET training institution, the ATTTTC. In grades 9 and 10 some schools offer vocational education specializations in Electrical (Electrical Wiring), Wood Work (Furniture and Cabinet Making), Agriculture (Crop Production), and Commerce (Business Methods and/or Book Keeping). Teachers for this level are recruited from those who have completed a DAE, B. Sc (Agri) and B. Com. They do not normally get any teacher training.

It would be prudent however that the planners give the reinsertion of TVE some serious consideration as a poorly implemented initiative could result in poor reception as experienced before. A wider national debate should be encouraged. But what is clear is that secondary education cannot be considered as a place for serious skill training. There is inadequate time to develop skill proficiency, tools and teaching materials might be lacking and the overall cost of sustaining the programme could be unavailable and raising serious concern about its sustainability. The issue of providing adequate number of qualified teachers should also be seriously thought out.

**Implementation Strategy**

*As this is an issue that is being developed at the national level within the education sector policy review, AJK should in the interim refine its current system in place in some schools by ensuring the provision of adequate teaching and learning resources and by strengthening its teacher training programme.*

**Action Plan**

- Review the middle school and secondary school technical and vocational education currently in place with the purpose of updating it to include subjects like IT and Entrepreneurship education,
- Strengthen teacher training and improve the terms of service of teachers by introducing a career path.

**3.14 Funding of TVET for Development and Recurrent Expenditure**
By its very nature TVET is expensive compared to other forms of education. The cost of setting up laboratories and workshops, providing the consumable training materials required and attracting qualified teachers is often higher. Once TVET institutions are set up, particularly public or government owned, funding for maintenance and updating of equipment is often not provided. Funding allocated to recurrent expenditure is often directed to salaries and utilities to the exclusion of training materials. Consequently the quality of training diminishes and time dedicated to practical training becomes less and less important. All factors being equal the investment in TVET is directly proportional to the quality of the training. Efforts must be made to increase the allocation of government support to TVET while efforts must be made to explore other options. As discussed elsewhere in this report, institutions should be given the flexibility to raise funds to support their programmes through exploitation of location and local needs. Another area that could be explored is the creation of a levy (taxation) on employers that would support training. In one such system hotels collect a training levy charged every customer who partakes of its services. The pooled funds are passed directly to the appropriate board managing the training of hotel workers. In another system industries pay a training levy depending on the size of its workforce. When an industry contributing to the levy trains its workers directly or through a third party institution it can claim reimbursement of part of the training cost. Industries not providing any training cannot present a claim. The ASDES paper has recommended a skills development fund to be managed by TEVTA which is essentially derived from government and donors.

**Implementation Strategy**

*AJK should explore the possibility of raising funds through a training levy to support the development of TVET. Funds raised shall be used for equipment and training materials in TVET institutions.*

**Action Plan**

- *Initiate a feasibility study on the introduction of a training levy system in AJK*

**3.15 Equity and Access**

Over time TVET courses have had a male domination with few females encouraged to join. Women constitute about half of the population and their input towards economic development cannot be ignored. However their numbers in the modern economy is far below their proportion. NAVTEC has recommended strategies to encourage the participation of women in traditional and non-traditional occupations which include increasing institutions for women and providing them with the appropriate support for credit. Efforts need to be made to ensure gender biases are removed from course materials and work environment made gender neutral with facilities provided for both men and women.

Access should be increased for all and especially disadvantaged groups such as women and the disabled by ensuring institutions are located where the poor or rural populations live. NAVTEC has proposed for example, the use of existing public facilities to be used for courses that will benefit populations that do not currently have access to TVET.
In AJK there are TEVTA institutions and other organizations such as the department of Social Welfare and Women Development (SWWD) and AKSIC which cater specifically to providing skills for women. Though commendable if no other opportunities are available, this approach would simply be perpetuating the division between occupations for women and those for men. Cultural practices have a significant influence in the kinds of courses women chose in Pakistan and AJK. Through efforts in guidance and counselling women should be encouraged to take up courses that may be currently male dominated but could appeal to women without threats to any cultural norms. Such courses might include electrical, electronics, drafting, ICT, etc.

**Implementation Strategy**

*TEVTA should make every effort to ensure that in all areas of the state the populations have a reasonable access to TVET institutions. In addition all areas and in all institutions equity and access should be ensured for those who are disadvantaged through gender or physical disability.*

**Action Plan**

- Map out the locations of all TVET institutions with the purpose of determining ability to access them.
- Increase access if necessary through use of idle time in existing schools or renting temporary facilities.
- Ensure all its institutions can be physically accessed by those with disabilities.
- Reserve places for the physically disadvantaged and females where competition is likely to shut them out.

**3.16 Strengthening of Management and Coordination of TVET**

It is very evident that the coordination of TVET in the country is not what it should be in spite of the formation of the NAVTEC and TEVTAs across the provinces and the AJK. The national body should implement a clear system for consultations with the provinces on the various issues regarding TVET. At the moment NAVTEC at least, through its strategy paper, has not set in motion clear methodology for coordinating the activities of the TEVTAs. Periodic consultation meetings at the management and technical levels should be clearly stated. At the national level for example, the NTB still functions independently which seems to negate the existence of NAVTEC. Within individual provinces and the AJK not all TVET programmes are under the coordination of TEVTAs. While within AJK there are some organizations that conduct skill training but are not directly managed by TEVTA. SWWD and AKSIC still manage a substantial number of training institutions. In such cases clear coordination mechanisms are essential. In the ASDES report a standing committee has been recommended as a way of having regular consultations. Such coordination will ensure each group knows plans and activities of the others and where necessary duplication could be avoided and scarce resources be spread more evenly.

**Implementation Strategy**

*TEVTA shall develop a system for ensuring all TVET implementers meet regularly to discuss relevant issues.*
Action Plan

- **TEVTA should form a standing committee of public and private sector TVET providers that would meet regularly to coordinate the implementation of TVET activities.**
- **AJKTEVTA as a key stakeholder should petition NAVTEC to introduce forums for periodic management and coordination of TVET and technical meetings/consultations**

4. **Stakeholders’ Meeting – August 4, 2009**

The draft AJK Skills Development Policy, Strategy and Action Plans was presented to a cross-section of the stakeholders at a workshop held at the Pearl Continental Hotel in Muzaffarabad on August 4, 2009. This report was prepared after extensive consultation with stakeholders across AJK (Muzaffarabad and Mirpur), Islamabad and Lahore. The purpose of the workshop therefore was to obtain the feedback of the participants to the strategies and action plans proposed to address the issues identified.

The function was attended and chaired by the Secretary of AJKTEVTA, two representatives of NAVTEC, some Principals of VTIs AKSIC and Social Welfare and Women’s Development Department among others (see Appendix V for the full list of participants). After a PowerPoint presentation of the identified issues and the proposed strategies and action plans the participants got an opportunity to respond. NAVTEC made a lengthy response covering most of the issues raised and the role the organization was playing to address them. Its representative reported that on some of the issues raised NAVTEC had started work on the strategies proposed in its policy document while on others plans were advanced to initiate action. The representative commended UNESCO on the work done and suggested that NAVTEC would implement as soon as possible the recommendation to hold regular consultation with the TEVTAs.

The Secretary of AJKTEVTA expressed his appreciation to UNESCO and the consultant for the work that had been done. He reiterated that his authority recognized the mandate of NAVTEC and will allow it to take the lead in those areas that it had jurisdiction. He pointed out that his organization would take up some of the proposals made in the UNESCO presentation should there be long delay in delivery by NAVTEC. He further stated that once the report was finalized they would study those that could be implemented quickly.

4.1 **Consolidated Log frame**

After the stakeholders’ consultations, the action plans for each of the issues were consolidated onto a log frame to provide readers an easy to read summary (see appendix I). The log frame includes projected time frames for implementation and expected estimate of the costs of proposed action plans. It should be noted that essentially each action plan forms a potential project for which a document would need to be prepared and accurate detailed
costs worked out. The cost estimates provided should therefore be treated with caution and as merely indicative.

5. **Efficacy of Implementation of the Action Plan**

The implementation of skills development in AJK has been placed under the responsibility of AJKTEVTA which was established in February 2007. It is a nascent organization that is trying to build its own internal capacity even as it tries to organize the TVET sector. Some public providers of TVET such as DSWWD and AKSIC do not formally come under the jurisdiction of TEVTA but during our consultations with them, each recognizes that TEVTA is the overarching body in the management of the sector. In looking ahead to predict the efficacy of implementation of the proposed action plans in this report one can see some constraints that might prevent action being taken or cause delays while in some implementation might not present such a challenge. The factors that will aid successful implementations or expected constraints shall be discussed in the next section.

5.1 **Factors that would aid successful implementation**

Some of the proposed actions might be fairly straightforward and might not require advanced technical skills or resources to implement. One example is the proposal by both this initiative and ASDES to form a forum for all TVET providers to meet regularly to map out their implementation to avoid duplication and maximize synergies. Another is organizing centralizing testing to increase the credibility of the programmes undertaken by trainees. According to TEVTA some organized skills testing is already in place. Action plan being proposed here is where they would get an external body like the NTB (or any other credibly institution) to lend their technical expertise to fine tune the quality and skills of the examiners. Yet another is the proposed improvement and integration of the informal sector training into the TEVTA system through registration of trainees and motivating them to attend part time training at the vocational institutions.

Other interventions require more time, technical expertise and training, for example, the setting up of an instructional supervision system as well as research and development unit within TEVTA. This action plan will require TEVTA to include in its structure and provision made for positions for the staff, office space and equipment for their use. A budgetary allocation would need to be approved for this undertaking on a sustainable basis. Another example of a long term intervention is the improvement of the quality of teachers of TVET. Depending on the implementation strategy taken, such as to develop an institution from the ground up, the activity could be costly and would require budgetary allocation or donor support for the construction and equipping initially and government allocation for recurrent costs to pay salaries of faculty, teaching materials and maintenance and utilities.

Whether complicated or less complicated, successful implementation would in large part depend on the motivation and attitude of the TEVTA leadership. The AJKTEVTA was only recently established and being a young organization it can be assumed that there would be plenty of motivation to succeed among its leadership and within the technical rank and file. As such the outcome of this initiative, along with others that have come before, would
provide them with goals to which to aspire. They have been given the opportunity to reflect on the issues in the sector and some solutions have been presented that they can work with.

5.2 Constraints to Implementation of the Action Plan

The major constraints to the implementation are human resources currently available with recently established AJK TEVTA; their technical capacity, and funding in that order. Often times funding is touted as the biggest impediment which is not really true. If the leadership is willing to embrace the changes proposed then the challenges of implementation becomes easier to surmount. As stated above some of the proposals have little or no financial implications and can be implemented as soon as possible depending on the direction given by the leadership. Even those that require budgetary support can be successfully lobbied to Treasury as they are so critical to the economic development of the state.

Some of the proposed actions clearly require sustainable budgetary support from the AJK government, especially those that have recommended the recruitment of staff. In some, a large outlay is required for the development phase before recurrent budget becomes necessary, example of this include new construction, equipment, training of specialists. In the case of the development expenditure, AJK can appeal to donors using the reports that have been prepared to bolster their proposals. Donors prefer reports generated through the support of third party facilitation. Such reports are deemed to have more credibility as theoretically they are less tainted by bias.

5.3 Role of Development Partners

Development partners have an important role in improving the effectiveness and efficiency of TVET sector. There has already been support to the AJKTEVTA following the earthquake of 2005. ILO and UNESCO have supported TEVTA in setting the ground work for the reform of the sector. Bilateral partners in particular the European Commission, according to the ASDES report, have shown interest in assisting AJK. Support by the development partners is absolutely crucial in improving the capacity of staff in TEVTA through training locally and abroad. With qualified staff TVET will be more than able to implement the various recommendations generated so far.

5.4 Way Forward

Several of the proposed action plans can be implemented simultaneously. Some will take longer to complete while others will take longer to initiate. The key recommendation would be to start from the simplest, least complicated and with the least budgetary implications. Success tends to increase confidence, which leads to improved motivation and likely to lead to more success. But for the most satisfactory outcome it is essential that AJKTEVTA implements a strong capacity building policy. Staff with the relevant qualification and experience is key to everything else. Hence there is need, as the action plans are implemented, for the capacity to be developed to support long term sustainability of the institution.
### Appendix 1: Summary of Strategy and Action Plan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Component</th>
<th>Strategy</th>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Outcome</th>
<th>Time Frame</th>
<th>Estimated Cost ($)</th>
<th>Responsible</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>National Policy</td>
<td>Develop own strategies in line with NAVTEC guidelines</td>
<td>Workshop for all stakeholders</td>
<td>Awareness of TVET Policies</td>
<td>Soon as NAVTEC Strategy is endorsed by Govt</td>
<td>30000</td>
<td>NAVTEC/TEVTA &amp; Development Partners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Relevance of Training</td>
<td>Introduce Work Attachment for TVET trainees in industry/workshops</td>
<td>Workshop for Managers and Instructors (3 days)</td>
<td>Awareness and uniform system for assessment</td>
<td>Jan-May 2011</td>
<td>2,500</td>
<td>TEVTA with support of partners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Appoint focal point and make budgetary provision for attachment costs</td>
<td>- Focal point - funded attachment</td>
<td>From July 2010</td>
<td>60,000*/year</td>
<td>TEVTA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conduct Market Surveys</td>
<td></td>
<td>Conduct regular market survey</td>
<td>Reliable market data of course relevance</td>
<td>July 2010 -2011</td>
<td>See R&amp;D</td>
<td>TEVTA with support of Dev partners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Introduce Institutional Mgt Boards</td>
<td></td>
<td>Appointment of Mgt Boards with TOR and conduct a training workshop (4, 1-day workshops)</td>
<td>Improved mgt of Institutions and better connection with stakeholders</td>
<td>Sept 2010</td>
<td>15,000</td>
<td>TEVTA with support of Dev Partners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Inadequate or in appropriate training equipment</td>
<td>Appeal for more budgetary support from Government</td>
<td>Workshop for Managers on preparation of budget and proposals to govt/donors (3 days)</td>
<td>- Awareness and stronger more credible proposals - improved funding for training equipment</td>
<td>Dec 2009-June 2012</td>
<td>7,500</td>
<td>TEVTA with support of Dev partners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Explore alternative funding sources</td>
<td></td>
<td>Workshop for Managers on income generation and transparency (2 days)</td>
<td>More funding available for equipment</td>
<td>Dec 2009-June 2012</td>
<td>5,000</td>
<td>TEVTA with support of Dev partners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Skills Standards</td>
<td>Develop capacity to develop skills standards for all practical courses</td>
<td>Train senior instructors in the development of skills standards for their trade</td>
<td>Trained staff in preparing skills standard</td>
<td>Jan 2010-June 2010</td>
<td>7,500</td>
<td>TEVTA with support of Dev partners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Develop skills standards for courses being offered by TEVTA +publications</td>
<td>Skills standards for all vocational courses in AJK</td>
<td>July 2010-June 2011</td>
<td>20,000</td>
<td>TEVTA with support of Dev partners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#</td>
<td>Component</td>
<td>Strategy</td>
<td>Action</td>
<td>Outcome</td>
<td>Time Frame</td>
<td>Estimated Cost</td>
<td>Responsible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Quality assurance</td>
<td>Strengthen quality assurance through an effective monitoring and evaluation system</td>
<td>develop a monitoring system to ensure quality control 4-day workshop</td>
<td>- Trained Monitors**&lt;br&gt;- Better quality of the training system</td>
<td>Nov 2009-Dec 2009</td>
<td>7,500</td>
<td>TEVTA with support of Dev partners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Introduce skill testing system similar to that of NTB but managed by TEVTA</td>
<td>A credible testing system for practical skills</td>
<td>Jan – June 2010</td>
<td>7,500</td>
<td>TEVTA with support of Dev partners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Outdated Curriculum</td>
<td>Use current curricula until the review process is initiated by NAVTEC</td>
<td>No direct immediate action is called for</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Develop curriculum development expertise in TEVTA</td>
<td>Capable Curriculum development expertise</td>
<td>Oct 2010-Dec 2010</td>
<td>8,000</td>
<td>TEVTA with support of partners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Introduce IT and Entrepreneurship ed.</td>
<td>Students with knowledge of Entrepreneurship and IT</td>
<td>Jan – Dec 2010</td>
<td>30,000</td>
<td>TEVTA with support of partners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Poor perception of</td>
<td>Ensure articulation in TVET progress and explore credit for prior learning</td>
<td>Review courses to determine amount of credit to be offered to those wishing to pursue higher level courses</td>
<td>Better articulated system, Satisfactory opportunities for advancement for TVET graduates</td>
<td>Jan – Dec 2011</td>
<td>7,500</td>
<td>TEVTA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>skilled workers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Apprenticeship</td>
<td>Explore the viability of introducing formal apprenticeship in locations with strong industrial presence</td>
<td>Conduct a feasibility study on the implementation of the apprenticeship system in AJK. (study + workshop)</td>
<td>Indication of locations where to focus apprenticeship training programme</td>
<td>Jan – Dec 2012</td>
<td>17,500</td>
<td>TEVTA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>System</td>
<td></td>
<td>Develop a VTI curriculum to complement industry component of apprenticeship training.</td>
<td>Well trained apprentices with a theoretical knowledge of practical process encountered in industry</td>
<td>Jan – Dec 2012</td>
<td>7,500</td>
<td>TEVTA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#</td>
<td>Component</td>
<td>Strategy</td>
<td>Action</td>
<td>Outcome</td>
<td>Time Frame</td>
<td>Estimated Cost</td>
<td>Responsible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Informal Training System</td>
<td>Introduce a skills testing system to accommodate informal sector trainees.</td>
<td>Introduce a credible skills testing (similar to those for the formal sector) and adapted as necessary. Devise a system for informal sector trainees to attend VTIs for theory input where possible.</td>
<td>Better trained informal sector trainees</td>
<td>July 2010-Dec 2010 and then continues</td>
<td>Inadequate material to base cost estimation</td>
<td>TEVTA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Research and Development</td>
<td>Establish in TEVTA an R&amp;D unit to collect relevant and to prepare analysis.</td>
<td><strong>Establish Unit and recruit qualified staff.</strong> <strong>Provide necessary training for staff.</strong> Provide necessary equipment (Computers, transport, etc)</td>
<td>Efficient Unit Reliable feasibility, tracer and enrolment data Decision making based on reliable data by TEVTA</td>
<td>July 2011-Dec 2011</td>
<td>Recurrent costs</td>
<td>TEVTA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Recurrent costs</td>
<td>TEVTA with support of Dev Partners</td>
<td>17,500</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Recurrent costs</td>
<td>TEVTA with support of Dev Partners</td>
<td>30,000</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Accreditation System</td>
<td>Develop minimum standards for the institutions and programmes</td>
<td>Develop a Manual of Standards, train staff and disseminate</td>
<td>- Manual of Standards - Trained Staff - Institutions that are credible</td>
<td>Jan-Dec 2010</td>
<td>20,000</td>
<td>TEVTA/NAVTEC with support of Dev partners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>TVET Teachers</td>
<td>Require all TVET teachers to attain approved teacher qualification with a career path</td>
<td>***Establish a TVET teacher training center. ***Establish a career path for TVET teachers.</td>
<td>A stand alone teacher training center A more motivated workforce able to attract good candidates</td>
<td>From July 2010</td>
<td>Budgetary</td>
<td>TEVTA with support of partners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>From July 2010</td>
<td>July 2010-June 2011</td>
<td>Budgetary</td>
<td>TEVTA with support of Dev partners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>TEVTA</td>
<td>July2010-June 2011</td>
<td>Budgetary</td>
<td>TEVTA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#</td>
<td>Component</td>
<td>Strategy</td>
<td>Action</td>
<td>Outcome</td>
<td>Time Frame</td>
<td>Estimated Cost</td>
<td>Responsible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>****TVE in the Secondary School Curriculum</td>
<td>As Education Policy under review, improve current programme and teaching standards</td>
<td>Introduce entrepreneurship and IT to all TVE students</td>
<td>Students with knowledge of Entrepreneurship and IT Which should improve their employment or further education options</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>TEVTA with support of Dev partners</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Provide incentives for all TVE teachers to seek professional training</td>
<td>Professional trained teacher force</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>TEVTA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Establish a career path for TVE teachers at the secondary level</td>
<td>A more motivated teaching force able to attract candidates</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>TEVTA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Equity and Access</td>
<td>Ensure access to TVET for all regionally, females and those with disabilities</td>
<td>Increase through better geographical locations for new constructions, and through use of idle public facilities and rentals</td>
<td>Accessibility to TVET training all</td>
<td>From Sept 2009</td>
<td>Budgetary provision</td>
<td>TEVTA/SWWDD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Improve accessibility to all institutions and to those with physical disabilities</td>
<td>Easier mobility for those with disabilities in TVET institutions</td>
<td>From July 2010</td>
<td>Budgetary provision</td>
<td>TEVTA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Reserve enrolment places for females and those with disabilities</td>
<td>better equity and access ratio</td>
<td>From July 2010</td>
<td>No Cost foreseen</td>
<td>TEVTA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Management and Coordination of TVET</td>
<td>Provision of regular consultation nationally and provisionally for implementers</td>
<td>Set up forums for regular consultations with private and public implementers</td>
<td>Better coordination and implementation of TVET programmes</td>
<td>¼ meetings to begin from Oct 2009</td>
<td>No Cost foreseen</td>
<td>TEVTA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Petition NAVTEC to institute regular consultation forums with TEVTAs at the Mgt and Technical levels</td>
<td>Better awareness of national issues and better resolution of global issues</td>
<td>¼ meetings to begin from Oct 2009</td>
<td>Budgetary</td>
<td>NAVTEC/TEVTA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Assumptions: Only 1, 2 and 3 year students are eligible for a total period of 2 months attachment. Based on current enrolment of about 1,200 students are eligible @ Rs 4,000 per student to cover stipend, allowances for teachers, and compensation to workshop owners.

3 officers appointed and placed at the divisional level. TEVTA has provided transportation + other support facilities. Training now crucial.

A Curriculum Unit has already been established

3 Officers appointed under the Dept of Planning on an interim basis. During with TEVTA it was felt this arrangement would deviate from the role of R&D.

Proposed training would take the form of attachment with organizations with similar Unit e.g. Punjab TEVTA and workshop for senior management.

Inadequate information to base estimates

Inadequate information from Min of Education to base estimate
Appendix 2

REFERENCES

Appendix 3

List of Stakeholders Consulted

In Islamabad:

July 16, 2009, Meeting with the Secretary General Pakistan National Commission for UNESCO

Location: UNESCO HOUSE – Pakistan National Commission for UNESCO, H-8, Islamabad

Present: Saqib Aleem Secretary General, Muhammad Dawood Deputy Secretary General, Yasir Arafat National Programme Officer UNESCO Islamabad

July 17, 2009, Meeting with NAVTEC,
Present, Mr. Muhammad Athar Tahir, Executive Director, NAVTEC (Pakistan), Mr. Muhammad Riaz, Director, Planning, NAVTEC and Dr. Irshad Tirmazi*, UNESCO TVET Specialist, Muzaffarabad

* All the appointments were organized by Dr. Tirmazi and he was present in the consultations with stakeholders except the on the first day July 16, when he was still in Muzaffarabad.

July 17, 2009, Ministry of Industries
Present: Mrs Shaista Sohail – Joint Secretary

July 17, 2009, Ministry of Food and Agriculture
Present: Dr. Qadir Bux Baloch Development Commissioner
Dr. Ikhlaque Hussain Shah, Director General Seeds.
Dr. Tasawar Hussain Malik, Deputy Agric. Development Commissioner.
Mr. Muhammad Asghar Chaudhry, Chief Agric. Policy Institute.
Mr. Abdul Rauf Chaudhry, Chief Agric. Policy Institute.
Mr. Zulqurnain Bokhari, Section Officer International Cooperation Wing.

July 20, 2009, Ministry of Education (Planning)
Present, Pervez Iqbal Joint education advisor

July 20, 2009, Planning Division
Industries and Commerce Section
Present, Mr. Riaz Ahmad Sahito, Deputy Chief Industries and Commerce Section (Chughtai Plaza Blue Area Islamabad).

Manpower Section
Mr. Javaid Ali, Chief Manpower Section, Education Section

Present, Talib Hussain Talib, Chief of Education Section

July 20, 2009, International Labour Organization (ILO)
Present, Manzoor Khaliq Senior Project Officer and Syed Saad Hussain Gilani, National Project Coordinator

July 20, 2009, Islamabad Chamber of Commerce and Industry
Present, Mian Shaukat Masud, President

July 21, 2009, National Commission for Human Development
Present, Mr. Ghulam Kassim, Director Monitoring and Evaluation

August 09, 2009, NAVTEC
Present:
Arif Hussain, Director General, Javeed Ahmed Malik, Director, Accreditation
Vickram Chetri, Project Manager, UNESCO ERP, Irshad Tirmazi, TVET Specialist

Lahore

July 18, 2009: Technical Education and Vocational Training Authority (TEVTA)

Present
Ms. Rafia Nazir, Secretary TEVTA.
Noman Ali Khan, General Manager (Operations).
Syed Iftikhar Hassain Shah, Director (Research & Dev).
Ms. Nabeela Kazmi, Manager (Training).
Ms. Saima Irfan, Deputy Director Vocational (Research & Dev).
Eng. Muhammad Arslan, Deputy Director (Technical).

Muzaffarabad

July 22, 2009 – AJKTEVTA
Present Mr. Javeed Iqbal Khwaja, Director/Secretary, TEVTA and Mr. Raja Shoukat Ali, Director, Technical; Zahid Ahmed Director Projects, TEVTA

July 22, 2009, AJKTEVTA met separately after the courtesy call with the Mr. Raja Shoukat Ali

July 22, 2009, Information Technology Board
Mr. Muhammed Sarwar Gondal, Director General and CEO

July 23, 2009, Dept of Planning and Development
Present, Bashir Ahmed Chaudry Chief Industry and IT

July 25, 2009, AJK Small Industries Corporation (semi-autonomous)
Present, Sardar Abdul Rauf Khan, Director

July 25, 2009 Employment Information Center (ILO Sponsored)
Present
Rizwan Shah Placement Officer
Ms Sumera Qureshi,
July 25, 2009, AJKTEVTA
Present, Raja Shaukat Ali, Director, Technical

July 30, 2009 – Directorate of Women Welfare and Development
Present,
Zahid Hussain, Director
Abdul Wahid Assistant Director (Planning)
Ms Nussat Shaheen, Assistant Director (Planning)

July 30, 2009, Valley Lodge (working lunch meeting)
Present Raja Shaukat Ali, Director, Technical,
Mohamed Kurshid, Principal Agro-Tech Teaching Training Center
Dr. Irshad Tirmazi

August 4, 2009, Pearl Continental
Workshop for presentation of the report

August 5, 2009, AJKTEVTA
Mr. Raja Shoukat Ali

**Mirpur**

July 27 Mirpur AJK Department of Industry Labour and Commerce
Present,
Zahid Hussain Anjum – Joint Director Industries and Deputy Registrar of Companies
and Sardar Sarfraz Khan – Assistant director of Industries

July 27, AJK Chamber of Commerce and Industry
Present, Chaudhry Zaved Iqbal: President
Khawaja Zafar Iqbal, Chairman, Standing Committee on Sick Industry
Raja Abdul Habib, Secretary General
Chaudhry Muhammad Shaﬁque, Secretary
Nadeem Ahmed Sadique, Media Advisor
Appendix 4

Sample Interview Questions Used in the Consultations

TVET Policy Consultancy
Meetings with stakeholders
Sample Questions

1. From your position and perspective how would you describe the state of TVET (skill development) in the country?

2. Are the human resources needs of the country being adequately met?

3. Explain your response

4. What do you believe are the issues in TVET that if addressed would improve the situation?

5. Why are they not being put in practice now?

6. What are your views on TVET at the secondary level? What type of curriculum would best address the needs of this level?

7. Do you see TVET at the secondary as preparation for employment or opportunity for students to explore potential career options?

8. What is your view regarding the management of TVET in the country?

9. How could this be improved?

10. How should the issue of curriculum be addressed so that changes are introduced as technology or world of work evolves?

11. Do you see a role for entrepreneurship education within TVET?

12. What is your view regarding the present system of testing and certifying TVET?

13. How could this be improved?

14. What is your opinion regarding the funding of TVET?

15. Could this be improved?

16. How could sustainable funding policies be adopted that are acceptable to the nation and other competing demands?

17. Who pays for TVET education at the secondary level?

18. Who pays for TVET at the post secondary level?
19. Do fees if any lock out those not able to pay? Issues of equity.

20. What role are employers currently playing in TVET?

21. How could the participation of employers be increased and be made more meaningful?

22. Is a training levy something that is currently in practice in the country? If not would it be acceptable to employers?

23. What are your views on the training of TVET teachers?

24. What improvements would you recommend?

25. What incentives are necessary to attract the best qualified individuals to TVET teaching?

26. Are both genders well represented in TVET?, If not why? And how should this issue be addressed
### List of Participants at the Experts Meeting on the presentation of the Draft Skill Development Policy, Strategy and Action Plan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Designation</th>
<th>Organization</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Javeed Iqbal Khawaja</td>
<td>Secretary</td>
<td>AJK TEVTA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Arif Hussain</td>
<td>Director General</td>
<td>NAVTEC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Javeed Ahmed Malik</td>
<td>Director - Accreditation</td>
<td>NAVTEC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Shaukat Ali Khan</td>
<td>Director, Technical</td>
<td>AJK TEVTA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Sardar Abdul Rauf Khan</td>
<td>Director,</td>
<td>AKSIC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Ms Sumera Mehboob Qureshi</td>
<td>Officer</td>
<td>EIC, ILO/ AKSIC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Syed Rizwan Ahmed</td>
<td>Placement Officer</td>
<td>EIC, ILO/ AKSIC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>M. Zahid Abbasi</td>
<td>Director - Projects</td>
<td>AJK TEVTA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Raja Muhammed Kurshid Khan</td>
<td>Principal</td>
<td>ATTTC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Bashir Ahmed Chaudhry</td>
<td>Chief</td>
<td>Industries &amp; IT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Sarfraz Ahmed Abbasi</td>
<td>Deputy Director/Coordinator</td>
<td>DSWWD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Muhammed Sadiq</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>Industries Deptt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Shakeed Ahmed Khan</td>
<td>Senior Instructor</td>
<td>AJK TEVTA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Mohammed Riaz Khan</td>
<td>Principal</td>
<td>AJKTEVTA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Nadeem Khaqan</td>
<td>Principal</td>
<td>AJKTEVTA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Ahsan Ahmed Qazi</td>
<td>Deputy Director</td>
<td>AJKTEVTA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Aziz Ahmad</td>
<td>District Programme Officer</td>
<td>NRSP</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Irshad Tirmazi</td>
<td>TVET Specialist</td>
<td>UNESCO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Ahmed Ferej</td>
<td>TVET Int’l Consultant</td>
<td>UNESCO</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>